

# **TEXAS PREP SOFTBALL**

# Coaches Survey Mercy Run Rules In District and Playoff Games

November 3, 2022 Billy G. Hicks

# BACKGROUND

There have been discussions within the Texas high school softball coaching community as to the "Mercy Run Rules" in district and playoff games. It has been noted in the past few years, some of the margins of victory by schools in the playoffs which are far more than 10 runs. Schools winning playoff games by 20, 25, even 30 or more runs is very concerning to many, including myself. This is also an issue in district play where there have been a few instances where the winning school has won a game by 40+ runs. I honestly do not think scores like that are healthy for our game and most especially, for our student-athletes.

The University Interscholastic League (UIL) establishes the rules concerning this issue and posted in the Softball Manual provided to all coaches before the season.

- Ten-Run Rule
  - The ten-run rule will be in effect for all games. After five (5) innings of play, if one team is ten (10) or more runs ahead of its opponent, the game shall be over. (Or if 4 1/2 innings have been completed and the home team is 10 or more funs ahead). https://www.uiltexas.org/softball/manual/softball-regular-season: "Miscellaneous Softball Regulations."
- Fifteen-Run Rule
  - By District Executive Committee approval, schools may use the fifteen (15) run rule after three (3) innings of play in district play. In non-district play, mutual consent of both schools is needed. <u>https://www.uiltexas.org/softball/manual/softball-regular-season</u>; "Miscellaneous Softball Regulations."
- Playoffs (Pre-Planning)
  - The 10-run rule is enforced in all playoff games. <u>https://www.uiltexas.org/softball/manual/softball-post-season-regulations</u>

# Mercy Rules by District

As a part of the survey, coaches were asked to post the mercy run rules that that use during their district play. You can use this as another form of reference data to help determine your thoughts on the following questions.

# **Survey Questions**

Coaches were asked to submit their thoughts on the following questions in this survey:

- 1. Are you in favor of a mandatory 15-run rule after 3 innings in DISTRICT PLAY?
- 2. Are you in favor of a mandatory 15-run rule after 3 innings in the PLAYOFFS?
- 3. Are you in favor of an optional 15-run rule after 3 innings (mutually agreed upon by the coaches involved) in the PLAYOFFS?

As a part of my work with Texas Prep Softball, which is mainly used by coaches to help fill their schedules and communicate news with each other, I keep, maintain, and update yearly, a comprehensive email list of head coaches in the UIL, Texas Association of Private and Parochial Schools (TAPPS), Southwest Preparatory Conference (SPC), and a few more schools of different organizations, and home schools.

Currently I have a total of 1252 head coaches on the list. Out of the 1174 schools listed on the UIL softball alignments, plus two new schools (Jayton & New Caney West Fork), I have 1156 on the list. The only ones missing are a few schools who still do not have a head coach named yet, some with websites which are incomplete, and a couple who are on the list to play but have told me that they are not participating this year.

In the past, it has been difficult to get a large number of softball coaches to participate in surveys until the last minute and while the number is better than the past, it is still not enough in my mind, but getting almost 500 to participate is a win for now.

# Here is the breakdown of the participation in this survey:

# **COACHES PARTICIPATION**

TOTAL COACHES VOTING BY CONFERENCE									
Conf	# Of Schools	# Voting	Pct						
6A	247	121	48.99%						
5A	251	110	43.82%						
4A	194	90	46.39%						
3A	213	72	33.80%						
2A	191	78	40.84%						
1A	78	15	19.23%						
TOTAL	1174	486	41.40%						

TOTAL COACHES VOTING BY REGION								
Region	# Of Schools	# Voting	Pct					
Region 1	283	110	38.87%					
Region 2	293	131	44.71%					
Region 3	300	129	43.00%					
Region 4	298	116	38.93%					
TOTAL	1174	486	41.40%					

# TOTAL COACHES VOTING BY CONFERENCE & REGION

			<b>.</b> .
Region	# Of Schools	# Voting	Pct
6A REGION 1	62	25	40.32%
6A REGION 2	64	34	53.13%
6A REGION 3	62	32	51.61%
6A REGION 4	59	30	50.85%
5A REGION 1	56	25	44.64%
5A REGION 2	60	30	50.00%
5A REGION 3	64	27	42.19%
5A REGION 4	71	28	39.44%
4A REGION 1	45	16	35.56%
4A REGION 2	45	25	55.56%
4A REGION 3	51	28	54.90%
4A REGION 4	53	21	39.62%
3A REGION 1	52	26	50.00%
3A REGION 2	56	18	32.14%
3A REGION 3	51	20	39.22%
3A REGION 4	53	8	15.09%
2A REGION 1	41	14	34.15%
2A REGION 2	45	23	51.11%
2A REGION 3	52	17	32.69%
2A REGION 4	53	24	45.28%
1A REGION 1	27	4	14.81%
1A REGION 2	23	1	4.35%
1A REGION 3	13	5	38.46%
1A REGION 4	15	5	33.33%

# SURVEY QUESTION #1

# Are you in favor of a mandatory 15-run rule after 3 innings in DISTRICT PLAY?

TOTAL VOTE: YES: 423 (87.04%) NO: 48 (9.88%) UNDECIDED: 15 (3.09%)

# SORTED BY CONFERENCE

#### MANDATORY IN DISTRICT PLAY

	YES		YES NO		UNDECIDED	
6A	99	81.82%	17	14.05%	5	4.13%
5A	94	85.45%	10	9.09%	6	5.45%
4A	76	84.44%	11	12.22%	3	3.33%
3A	63	87.50%	8	11.11%	1	1.39%
2A	77	98.72%	1	1.28%	0	0.00%
1A	14	93.33%	1	6.67%	0	0.00%
Total	423	87.04%	48	9.88%	15	3.09%

# SORTED BY REGION (ALL CONFERENCES)

# MANDATORY IN DISTRICT PLAY

	YES		NO		UNDECIDED	
<b>REGION 1</b>	88	80.00%	21	19.09%	1	0.91%
<b>REGION 2</b>	115	87.79%	10	7.63%	6	4.58%
<b>REGION 3</b>	111	86.05%	13	10.08%	5	3.88%
<b>REGION 4</b>	109	93.97%	4	3.45%	3	2.59%
Total	423	87.04%	48	9.88%	15	3.09%

# SORTED BY CONFERENCE AND REGION

#### MANDATORY IN DISTRICT PLAY

	YES		NO		UNDECIDED	
6A REGION 1	15	60.00%	10	40.00%	0	0.00%
6A REGION 2	29	85.29%	3	8.82%	2	5.88%
6A REGION 3	27	84.38%	3	9.38%	2	6.25%
6A REGION 4	28	93.33%	1	3.33%	1	3.33%
Total	99	81.82%	17	14.05%	5	4.13%
5A REGION 1	18	72.00%	6	24.00%	1	4.00%
5A REGION 2	26	86.67%	2	6.67%	2	6.67%
5A REGION 3	23	85.19%	2	7.41%	2	7.41%
5A REGION 4	27	96.43%	0	0.00%	1	3.57%
Total	94	85.45%	10	9.09%	6	5.45%
4A REGION 1	14	87.50%	2	12.50%	0	0.00%
4A REGION 2	21	84.00%	3	12.00%	1	4.00%
4A REGION 3	23	82.14%	4	14.29%	1	3.57%
4A REGION 4	18	85.71%	2	9.52%	1	4.76%
Total	76	84.44%	11	12.22%	3	3.33%
3A REGION 1	24	92.31%	2	7.69%	0	0.00%
3A REGION 2	15	83.33%	2	11.11%	1	5.56%
3A REGION 3	16	80.00%	4	20.00%	0	0.00%
3A REGION 4	8	100.00%	0	0.00%	0	0.00%
Total	63	87.50%	8	11.11%	1	1.39%
2A REGION 1	13	92.86%	1	7.14%	0	0.00%
2A REGION 2	23	100.00%	0	0.00%	0	0.00%
2A REGION 3	17	100.00%	0	0.00%	0	0.00%
2A REGION 4	24	100.00%	0	0.00%	0	0.00%
	77	98.72%	1	1.28%	0	0.00%
1A REGION 1	4	100.00%	0	0.00%	0	0.00%
1A REGION 2	1	100.00%	0	0.00%	0	0.00%
1A REGION 3	5	100.00%	0	0.00%	0	0.00%
1A REGION 4	4	80.00%	1	20.00%	0	0.00%
	14	93.33%	1	6.67%	0	0.00%

# SURVEY QUESTION #2

# Are you in favor of a mandatory 15-run rule after 3 innings in the PLAYOFFS?

YES: 317 (65.23%) NO: 112 (23.05%) UNDECIDED: 57 (11.73%)

# SORTED BY CONFERENCE

MANDATORY IN PLAYOFFS										
	YES		NO		UND	DECIDED				
6A	71	58.68%	37	30.58%	13	10.74%				
5A	71	64.55%	25	22.73%	14	12.73%				
4A	57	63.33%	20	22.22%	13	14.44%				
3A	50	69.44%	15	20.83%	7	9.72%				
2A	55	70.51%	13	16.67%	10	12.82%				
1A	13	86.67%	2	13.33%	0	0.00%				
Total	317	65.23%	112	23.05%	57	11.73%				

## SORTED BY REGION

#### MANDATORY IN PLAYOFFS

	YES		NO		UNI	DECIDED
<b>REGION 1</b>	71	64.55%	34	30.91%	6	5.45%
<b>REGION 2</b>	83	63.36%	29	22.14%	18	13.74%
<b>REGION 3</b>	83	64.34%	28	21.71%	18	13.95%
<b>REGION 4</b>	80	68.97%	21	18.10%	15	12.93%
Total	317	65.23%	112	23.05%	57	11.73%

# SORTED BY CONFERENCE AND REGION

#### MANDATORY IN PLAYOFFS

Y	NDATORT	NO			DECIDED	
6A REGION 1	12	48.00%	12	48.00%	1	4.00%
6A REGION 2	20	58.82%	10	40.00 <i>%</i> 29.41%	4	11.76%
6A REGION 3	20	68.75%	6	18.75%	4	12.50%
6A REGION 4	17	56.67%	9	30.00%	4	13.33%
Total	71	58.68%	37	30.58%	13	10.74%
lotal	, ,	50.0070	57	50.5070	15	10.7470
5A REGION 1	15	60.00%	8	32.00%	2	8.00%
5A REGION 2	24	80.00%	5	16.67%	1	3.33%
5A REGION 3	16	59.26%	7	25.93%	4	14.81%
5A REGION 4	16	57.14%	5	17.86%	7	25.00%
Total	71	64.55%	25	22.73%	14	12.73%
4A REGION 1	10	62.50%	4	25.00%	2	12.50%
4A REGION 2	14	56.00%	7	28.00%	4	16.00%
4A REGION 3	17	60.71%	6	21.43%	5	17.86%
4A REGION 4	16	76.19%	3	14.29%	2	9.52%
Total	57	63.33%	20	22.22%	13	14.44%
3A REGION 1	19	73.08%	6	23.08%	1	3.85%
3A REGION 2	13	72.22%	3	16.67%	2	11.11%
3A REGION 3	11	55.00%	6	30.00%	3	15.00%
3A REGION 4	7	87.50%	0	0.00%	1	12.50%
Total	50	69.44%	15	20.83%	7	9.72%
2A REGION 1	11	78.57%	4	28.57%	0	0.00%
2A REGION 2	11	47.83%	4	17.39%	7	30.43%
2A REGION 3	13	76.47%	2	11.76%	2	11.76%
2A REGION 4	20	83.33%	3	12.50%	1	4.17%
	55	70.51%	13	16.67%	10	12.82%
1A REGION 1	4	100.00%	0	0.00%	0	0.00%
1A REGION 2	1	100.00%	0	0.00%	0	0.00%
1A REGION 3	4	80.00%	1	20.00%	0	0.00%
1A REGION 4	4	80.00%	1	20.00%	0	0.00%
	13	86.67%	2	13.33%	0	0.00%

# **SURVEY QUESTION #3**

Are you in favor of an optional 15-run rule after 3 innings (mutually agreed upon by the coaches involved) in the PLAYOFFS?

YES: 391 (80.45%) NO: 74 (15.23%) UNDECIDED: 21 (4.32%)

#### SORTED BY CONFERENCE

OPTIONAL IN PLAYOFFS										
		YES		NO	UNDECIDED					
6A	92	76.03%	25	20.66%	4	3.31%				
5A	93	84.55%	12	10.91%	5	4.55%				
4A	71	78.89%	14	15.56%	5	5.56%				
3A	58	80.56%	13	18.06%	1	1.39%				
2A	66	84.62%	7	8.97%	5	6.41%				
1A	11	73.33%	3	20.00%	1	6.67%				
Total	391	80.45%	74	15.23%	21	4.32%				

# SORTED BY REGION

OPTIONAL IN PLAYOFFS								
	YES NO			NO	UND	ECIDED		
<b>REGION 1</b>	85	77.27%	22	20.00%	3	2.73%		
<b>REGION 2</b>	110	83.97%	17	12.98%	4	3.05%		
<b>REGION 3</b>	106	82.17%	16	12.40%	7	5.43%		
<b>REGION 4</b>	90	77.59%	19	16.38%	7	6.03%		
Total	391	80.45%	74	15.23%	21	4.32%		

# SORTED BY CONFERENCE AND REGION

#### **OPTIONAL IN PLAYOFFS**

	YES		NO	0110	UN	DECIDED
6A REGION 1	16	64.00%	8	32.00%	1	4.00%
6A REGION 2	28	82.35%	5	14.71%	1	2.94%
6A REGION 3	22	68.75%	9	28.13%	1	3.13%
6A REGION 4	26	86.67%	3	10.00%	1	3.33%
Total	92	76.03%	25	20.66%	4	3.31%
	52	, 0.00,0	20	20100/0	•	0.01/0
5A REGION 1	20	80.00%	5	20.00%	0	0.00%
5A REGION 2	28	93.33%	2	6.67%	0	0.00%
5A REGION 3	23	85.19%	2	7.41%	2	7.41%
5A REGION 4	22	78.57%	3	10.71%	3	10.71%
Total	93	84.55%	12	10.91%	5	4.55%
4A REGION 1	11	68.75%	3	18.75%	2	12.50%
4A REGION 2	21	84.00%	2	8.00%	2	8.00%
4A REGION 3	25	89.29%	2	7.14%	1	3.57%
4A REGION 4	14	66.67%	7	33.33%	0	0.00%
Total	71	78.89%	14	15.56%	5	5.56%
3A REGION 1	21	80.77%	5	19.23%	0	0.00%
3A REGION 2	13	72.22%	5	27.78%	0	0.00%
3A REGION 3	17	85.00%	2	10.00%	1	5.00%
3A REGION 4	7	87.50%	1	12.50%	0	0.00%
Total	58	80.56%	13	18.06%	1	1.39%
2A REGION 1	13	92.86%	1	7.14%	0	0.00%
2A REGION 2	19	82.61%	3	13.04%	1	4.35%
2A REGION 3	15	88.24%	0	0.00%	2	11.76%
2A REGION 4	19	79.17%	3	12.50%	2	8.33%
	66	84.62%	7	8.97%	5	6.41%
1A REGION 1	4	100.00%	0	0.00%	0	0.00%
1A REGION 2	1	100.00%	0	0.00%	0	0.00%
1A REGION 3	4	80.00%	1	20.00%	0	0.00%
1A REGION 4	2	40.00%	2	40.00%	1	20.00%
	11	73.33%	3	20.00%	1	6.67%

# MERCY RULE BY DISTRICT -- UIL CONFERENCE 6A

IVIERCT RU		LI UIL CONFERE				
DISTRICT	10 AFTER 5 ONLY	15 AFTER 3, 10 AFTER 5	15 AFTER 4, 10 AFTER 5	ALL OTHERS	NAME OF COACH SUBMITTING	SCHOOL
1	YES	NO	OPTIONAL		Shawn O'Neal	El Paso Socorro
2	YES				Shawnda Vines	Midland High
3		YES			Jeff Lemons	Weatherford HS
4	YES				Tim Stuewe	Southlake Carroll
5		YES			Kathy Schoettle	Allen HS
6	YES				Porscha Albert	Lewisville HS
7		YES			Courtney Sims	Richardson
8		YES			Thanh Kinder	Grand Prairie HS
9		YES			Jennifer Sisson	Garland HS
10		YES			Lee Kuyrkendall	Royse City HS
11						
12			YES		Bryan Waller	Copperas Cove
13		YES			Tim Borths	The Woodlands HS
14		YES			Julie Wyrick	Spring HS
15	YES				Barry Wilson	Klein Oak HS
16		YES			Michele Biffle	Langham Creek
17		YES			Marissa Stevens	Cy-Fair HS
18				15 after 3, 8 after 5	Brien Tuffly	Bellaire
19		YES			Billie Powell	Katy Taylor
20		Yes			Jon Maples	Fort Bend Dulles
21						
22						
23		Yes			Laneigh Clark	Pearland
24				10 after 4, 8 after 5	Jennifer Knight	Clear Springs
25		YES			Jessica Poole	Cedar Ridge
26		Үер			Wade Womack	Dripping Springs
27		Yes			Amanda Balthun	Clemens
28		Yes			Valerie Barrera	San Antonio-LEE High School
29		Yes			Brian Sandera	Sotomayor HS
30		Yes			Javier Morin	United HS
31						
32		Yes			Elias Martinez	San Benito CISD

# **MERCY RULE BY DISTRICT -- UIL CONFERENCE 5A**

WERCT RU		CI UIL CONFERE				
DISTRICT	10 AFTER 5 ONLY	15 AFTER 3, 10 AFTER 5	15 AFTER 4, 10 AFTER 5	ALL OTHERS	NAME OF COACH SUBMITTING	SCHOOL
1						
2	YES			15 after 3 if agreed upon by both coaches	Shelley Prather	Hanks
3				Τ		
4	Yes				Sherri Culwell	Lubbock-Cooper
5	yes				Laura Williams	Saginaw
6		Yes			Drew Wyrick	South Hills
7		Yes			Meghann Morrow	Everman
8		Yes			Shannon Sullivan	Burleson-Centennial
9	Yes	Yes		12 after 4	J.C. Salazar	R.L. Turner
10	Yes	If agreed			Tim O'Brien	Frisco Heritage
11		Yes		12 after 4	Katie Allen	Woodrow Wilson
12						
13						
14		Yes			Jonathan Rogers	Red Oak
15		Yes			Kayla Whatley	Hallsville
16		Yes			Kelsie McEachern	Kingwood Park
17		YES			Aaron Fuller	Barbers Hill
18						
19		YES			Mario Puente	Milby HIgh School
20						
21	Yes				Katie Roberts	Brenham HS
22	yes	Yes	Yes		Morgan Birkel	Ellison High School
23		Yes			Melissa Hall	Georgetown
24		YES			Rachel Whatley	Austin McCallum
25						
26		Yes			John Garcia	Seguin
27		Yes			Kevin Lewis	CC Ray
28		Yes			Buentello	Medina Valley
29		YES			Melissa Buck	Victoria East
30		YES			Jessica Cardenas-Russell	Palmview
31		Yes			Aissa Hinojosa	Nikki Rowe
32		Yes			Rayner Cardenas	Brownsville Veterans Memoria

# MERCY RULE BY DISTRICT -- UIL CONFERENCE 4A

DISTRICT	10 AFTER 5 ONLY	15 AFTER 3, 10 AFTER 5	15 AFTER 4, 10 AFTER 5	ALL OTHERS	NAME OF COACH SUBMITTING	SCHOOL
1	Yes	15 after 3 optional			Laura Pacheco	Young Women's STEAM Acade
2						
3	Yes				Carol Vaughn	Andrews
4	Yes				Tessa Powell	Perryton High School
5						
6		yes			Adam Arrington	Graham
7		yes			Toby Kloewer	Sanger
8		yes			Jennifer Ragland	Bridgeport
9						
10		yes			Rus Mayes	Godley
11						
12		yes			Christopher Barnhill	North Dallas
13		yes			Lauren Strickland	Community
14		yes			Colby Sales	Mabank
15						
16		yes			Baleigh Briggs	Van
17		Yes			Cheyenne Kirkpatrick	Kilgore
18		Yes			Julie Murry	Bullard
19		Yes			Michelle Weichert	Silsbee
20		yes			Karen Slack	Liberty
21		Yes			Voncia Ducre	Brazosport
22						
23			Yes		Jimmy Eby	Robinson
24		yes			Michael Cole	Lago Vista
25		Yes			Brittney Whitehead. Rachel Toney	Sealy, La Marque
26		Yes			Rilea Sanders	Bay City
27		Yes			Robert Klick	Wimberley
28		yes			Michelle Uribe	Gonzales
29		yes			E.J. McNamara	Uvalde
30		Yes			Nathaniel Mircovich	Ingleside
31						
32						
				1	1	1

# MERCY RULE BY DISTRICT -- UIL CONFERENCE 3A

	MERCY RULE BY DISTRICT UIL CONFERENCE 3A							
DISTRICT	10 AFTER 5 ONLY	15 AFTER 3, 10 AFTER 5	15 AFTER 4, 10 AFTER 5	ALL OTHERS	NAME OF COACH SUBMITTING	SCHOOL		
1	yes				Nix	Tulia		
2	Yes				Walt Mangan	Idalou		
3	Yes							
4								
5		Yes			Michael Seales	Blanco		
6	YES				Erica Jones	Jim Ned		
7		Yes			Eric Simmons	Iowa Park		
8		Yes			Maddie Ray	Peaster		
9		Yes			Courtney Chambers	Palmer		
10		Yes			Brandy Courville	S&S		
11		Yes			Micky Englutt	Bonham		
12		Yes		15/3, 12/4, 10/5	Scott Delozier	Rains		
13	Yes	Yes			Taelor Cheshier	Mineola		
14								
15	Yes	Yes			Tisha Thompson	Hughes Springs		
16	Yes	Yes			Billy Holcomb	Arp		
17		Yes			Waylon Whitney	Maypearl		
18								
19			Yes	15/4, 10/5	LaBaron Graham	Cameron		
20		Yes		15/3, 10/5	Ronald Berryhill	Westwood		
21		YES		15/3, 10/5	Crystal Massey	Huntington		
22		yes			Jerry Gore	Kirbyville		
23		Yes			Doug Sanchez	Trinity		
24								
25		Yes			Chasity Matula	Industrial		
26		Yes			Sammy Scribner	Marion		
27								
28		Yes		15/3 10/5	Monica Chovanec	Yoakum		
29								
30		YES			Thomas De Los Santos	Santa Gertrudis Academy		
31		Yes		Unless mutally agreed upon to keep playing by both schools	Andrew Sierra	IDEA Donna		
32								

		ICT UIL CONFERE	-			
DISTRICT	10 AFTER 5 ONLY	15 AFTER 3, 10 AFTER 5	15 AFTER 4, 10 AFTER 5	ALL OTHERS	NAME OF COACH SUBMITTING	SCHOOL
1						
2		Yes			Kelsey Williams, Jennifer Bourland	Seymour, Vernon Northside
3		YES		15/3 and 10/5	Armando Morales	Floydada
4		1				
5	Yes				Shane Fuller	Reagan County
6		15/3 (if agreed upon at plate) and 10/5			Halee Marth	Christoval
7		Yes			Jason Botos	Hamlin
8		Yes		10 after 5	Jayton Thompson	Eula
9		Yes			Alyson Deatherage	Windthorst
10		Yes			Ryan Starnes	Muenster
11						
12		Yes		15/3 and 10/5	Keith Johnson, Eddie Gallegos	Rio Vista, Jonesboro
13		Yes		1	Ashley Smith	Bruceville-Eddy
14		Yes			Mike Saucke	Hubbard
15		Yes		1	Bruce Brignac	Mart
16		Yes		1	Stephen Trussell	Cooper
17			Yes		Trevor Wallace	Como-Pickton
18			Yes		Kelly Fay	Harleton
19		YES		15/3 10/5	Jennifer Hawkins	Hawkins
20		Yes			Jayson Engel	Kerens
21		Yes			Rusti Hall	Corrigan-Camden
22		YES			Ryan Mason	Shelbyville
23						
24		Yes			Donald Mayhugh, McKenzie Vaughan	Chireno, Brookeland
25				1		
26				1		
27		1				
28		yes		15/3 10/5	Kenny King	Center Point
29		YES		15/3 10/5	Shawn Bruns	Flatonia
30		yes		15/3, 10/5	Jose Martinez	D'Hanis
31		yes		15/3 10/5	James Hinojosa	Three Rivers
32	+	+			+	1

# **FINAL THOUGHTS**

From my analysis of the results of this survey, I do not think there is a mandate to make a mandatory 15-run rule in the playoffs. Several coaches have asked me why softball needs to have a double or even triple mercy rule when other sports just have one (i.e., baseball at 10 after 5, 1A football at 45 points as halftime or later). Others question why we need the mandatory fifteen run rule in the playoffs when it is not mandated in district play.

The results show that the coaches would more likely favor an optional 15-run rule in the playoffs, like the decisions of the individual District Executive Committees. I am not sure what numbers the UIL, TGCA, and THSCA would consider as a mandate to implement this as a rule favored by the softball coaches in our state. I honestly would like to see a larger majority of coaches participate in this question in the future, but the fact that we were very close to 500 coaches participating is a step forward.

My honest opinion is that if we proceed to a mandatory 15-run rule in the playoffs, then we must do the same for district and non-district play as well. The fact that over 87% of the coaches who participated in the survey favored a 15-run rule in district play would support that thought.

Thanks for your time in reading and consideration of this survey and it is a starting point in the conversation of whether we should have a mandatory or optional 15-run mercy rule in the softball playoffs.

On the following pages are comments taken from the survey from coaches participating.

# COMMENTS:

# **CONFERENCE 6A**

This rule proposal was written as MUTUAL AGREEMENT by BOTH coaches so that no one could be forced into using the run rule.

We eliminated the 15 after 3 inn rule with the new alignment.

I think there should at least be an option.

I have seen teams score 20 runs on a team that couldn't compete with them in the playoffs, until they could get to the 5th inning to end the game. We need to remember that these are high school kids, with sometimes the 4th seed obviously outmatched playing a 1 seed. There is absolutely no reason to run score ups. Ending the game after 3 innings/15 run rule, seems what is best for all the kids playing and isn't that why we're here... what's best for kids.

I've seen and coached too many games that ended in the 3rd with the 15 run rule. Without this in place, those games likely would have been larger blowouts with much bigger deficits. Many of these games, teams are not trying to run up the score (as they shouldn't). In my opinion this does absolutely nothing for either team. It indicates a huge imbalance in skill and caliber, does not create the competition necessary to grow (winning team), and is completely defeating culture-wise and mentally for the losing team.

One team might have a horrendous inning, but then get things going, and the other team might have a similar inning later in the game.

Too many teams make the playoffs. If you are getting beat by 15 after 3 innings that is a prime example

I am still curious why we would be the only sport to have a different mercy rule. If safety were the real reason, are there studies that show softball players are disproportionally injured vs other sports? I understand the mutually agreed upon by both coaches, maybe this is the common ground, but the afore mentioned rational is still my official standing. I would like to see research how softball players are injured more in the first round vs. other sports. If that is the case, then I will be more inclined to agree with the change. Also, keep in mind that some schools drive several hours for playoff games and district and to only play 3 innings might be a reason not to have the 15 after 3.

# **CONFERENCE 5A**

Our district allows it if agreed upon by both coaches. I would like it to be 20 runs after 3 and 15 after 4 innings. Sometimes, if you're home team and you score exactly 15 runs through 2 innings, it doesn't seem like you even played a game.

Our district states for 15 after 3 if agreed upon, some umpires won't even ask they just say this is what it is going to be.

Prevents teams from completely embarrassing and damaging the integrity of the game

# Decide at the Plate

It would alleviate unnecessary high scores because of the disparity of some programs. I have been on the end of both high scores and after a point it is not beneficial for anyone.

# Change it to 5th inning

I think that if coaches agree to use the 15 after 3 innings in playoffs, then the team MUST play 1 game. I don't think it is right to play 3 inning games and force teams to travel both days for that type of a game.

Our district is 15 after 4 not 3

I would love to discuss any questions in regard to what was presented by THSCA for (mutually agreed) upon 15 run rule. I am in favor of 15 run rule as long as agreed upon by coaches in playoffs and only for the first round of playoffs.

This past year I witness too many come backs, thus if a team is capable then they should have the opportunity to play and close the gap.

Should always consider this.

I fully understand some peoples reasonings for wanting the option of using a 15-Run Rule, but do not believe that there needs to be a universal mandate that ties someones hands. Some teams I have played in the past are constantly pushing for the 15 after 3 run rule and I believe 2 things in this regard, if you can't compete, then don't play and if you aren't good enough get better. Everyone essentially has the same opportunities to work with kids during school and outside of it, if you can't get them to show or raise interest, they need to rethink some things. Kids get better with opportunities and experience, whether its good or bad!

99.9% of games that are 15 or more runs after 3 innings are already over. Nobody is getting anything out of those games, other than possibly injured.

# **CONFERENCE 4A**

I do not know that I would call ours mandatory, I think of it more like declaring economic victory in Axis and Allies. I mean, I guess it is mandatory if one or both schools want to enforce it, which, most of the time, is the case.

We are a small school in a very large district & get hammered...there is no 15 after 3 in our district & some games it's hard to keep playing

Especially in the first round against some of the weaker teams. Last year we literally stepped off base for every out in the game except 1.

This would eliminate the beat down that some teams like to put on inferior teams.

I would think that schools should have to both agree on the 15 after 3 rule.

Not 100% sure if district mandates rule because I'm new to this district but fairly certain

Run rule should be in place for a matter of safety and sportsmanship.

I have always agreed with the 15 run mercy rule. I especially like the idea of the mutually agreed upon prior to the start of the game idea.

Mutally agreed upon seems ideal

For obvious reasons, I don't like it mandated in district. Mainly because it limits the number of innings and touches my team gets. As far as playoff go, I like the rule because it allows me to save pitching.

I've seen comebacks from more than 15 runs down due to a team gaining momentum. I wouldn't want to take that opportunity away. Also if a coach feels that a game is in hand, they could get some kids in a playoff setting for experience and not run up a score by playing the better players.

No nobody needs to be beaten by more than 15 runs in a high school softball game. I am a fan of all run rules as they help keep the integrity of the game on tact.

# **CONFERENCE 3A**

15 after 3 in the Playoffs is needed. Especially for the first round.

I am for the 15 after 3 rule, simply because I have been on teams that were power houses and beating someone 30 - 0 does no one any good when they have to be given outs just to get to the 5th inning. I am also coaching a team that struggles and it does them no good to be given outs to get through to 5 innings so they can finish the game. It really tears us down when we play state level teams in our district. 5 inning games take forever when teams do not want to give outs whether they are trying to allow us to get them ourselves or just refusal to do so. I've been on both sides and it does no good for either side.

We beat one school in our district 36-4 and 47-2 last year bunting after the first inning. And won 33-0 in the Bidistrict game as well. Doesn't make anyone better and honestly it truly is a lost game on the schedule to play them

Been on both sides of run rules. The coaches should mutually agree if 3 innings is an option. Sometimes 3 may be perfectly ok for both teams. But, I've gone 2 hrs and 45 minutes to a playoff game and lost in 45 minutes. 9 up, 9 down. If I have to go that far, can we at least play 5? The winning coach won't care. The chances of them losing is near zero. They can get their back-ups experience in a playoff game. Most coaches will step off the bag if needed, to keep the score from getting too bad. I am sure the Umps would prefer 3 since the pay is the same.

It sucks if you are a 4th seed playing in a playoff ball game and you lose 19-0 because you have to finish the game. It gets ugly fast and the emotions you have to deal with from your seniors are not good ones to end on.

The UIL does not recognize a game as a complete game if it is less than 5 innings. Therefore, a 3 inning game should not count in the standings. Also, with the cost of travel and distances some teams have to go, is it really worth going to play a 3 inning game? I have been in games where I was winning big against a team. There are still things you can work on without running up the score. Also, being in the position of being the losing team, I believe you can learn how to persevere and find a way to get the job done.

On occasion you get paired up with a very weak district and this rule would help keep coaches from having to find ways to get themselves out in order not to score 25 or 30runs in a game.

# **CONFERENCE 2A**

I believe 15 run rule should be mandatory atleast for the first 2 rounds, the past 2 years I have not had a playoff caliber team, but do to a very weak district we made it in, and both years were against far superior teams, one of those years the coach of the other team played it right and got the game over in a classy manner. The other year the coach ran the score up because they could, beating us by 28 while still stealing bases.

Been on both sides of the 15 after 3. This is needed in playoffs

Our District has a 15 run after 4 innings

I believe playoff games should be complete games, I would be in favor of 10 after 5