

# **TEXAS PREP SOFTBALL**

# Coaches Survey Mercy Run Rules In District and Playoff Games

November 3, 2022 Billy G. Hicks

# BACKGROUND

There have been discussions within the Texas high school softball coaching community as to the "Mercy Run Rules" in district and playoff games. It has been noted in the past few years, some of the margins of victory by schools in the playoffs which are far more than 10 runs. Schools winning playoff games by 20, 25, even 30 or more runs is very concerning to many, including myself. This is also an issue in district play where there have been a few instances where the winning school has won a game by 40+ runs. I honestly do not think scores like that are healthy for our game and most especially, for our student-athletes.

The University Interscholastic League (UIL) establishes the rules concerning this issue and posted in the Softball Manual provided to all coaches before the season.

- Ten-Run Rule
  - The ten-run rule will be in effect for all games. After five (5) innings of play, if one team is ten (10) or more runs ahead of its opponent, the game shall be over. (Or if 4 1/2 innings have been completed and the home team is 10 or more funs ahead). https://www.uiltexas.org/softball/manual/softball-regular-season: "Miscellaneous Softball Regulations."
- Fifteen-Run Rule
  - By District Executive Committee approval, schools may use the fifteen (15) run rule after three (3) innings of play in district play. In non-district play, mutual consent of both schools is needed. <u>https://www.uiltexas.org/softball/manual/softball-regular-season</u>; "Miscellaneous Softball Regulations."
- Playoffs (Pre-Planning)
  - The 10-run rule is enforced in all playoff games. <u>https://www.uiltexas.org/softball/manual/softball-post-season-regulations</u>

# Mercy Rules by District

As a part of the survey, coaches were asked to post the mercy run rules that that use during their district play. You can use this as another form of reference data to help determine your thoughts on the following questions.

# **Survey Questions**

Coaches were asked to submit their thoughts on the following questions in this survey:

- 1. Are you in favor of a mandatory 15-run rule after 3 innings in DISTRICT PLAY?
- 2. Are you in favor of a mandatory 15-run rule after 3 innings in the PLAYOFFS?
- 3. Are you in favor of an optional 15-run rule after 3 innings (mutually agreed upon by the coaches involved) in the PLAYOFFS?

As a part of my work with Texas Prep Softball, which is mainly used by coaches to help fill their schedules and communicate news with each other, I keep, maintain, and update yearly, a comprehensive email list of head coaches in the UIL, Texas Association of Private and Parochial Schools (TAPPS), Southwest Preparatory Conference (SPC), and a few more schools of different organizations, and home schools.

Currently I have a total of 1252 head coaches on the list. Out of the 1174 schools listed on the UIL softball alignments, plus two new schools (Jayton & New Caney West Fork), I have 1156 on the list. The only ones missing are a few schools who still do not have a head coach named yet, some with websites which are incomplete, and a couple who are on the list to play but have told me that they are not participating this year.

In the past, it has been difficult to get a large number of softball coaches to participate in surveys until the last minute and while the number is better than the past, it is still not enough in my mind, but getting almost 500 to participate is a win for now.

# Here is the breakdown of the participation in this survey:

# **COACHES PARTICIPATION**

| TOTAL COACHES VOTING<br>BY CONFERENCE |              |          |        |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|---------------------------------------|--------------|----------|--------|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| Conf                                  | # Of Schools | # Voting | Pct    |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6A                                    | 247          | 121      | 48.99% |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5A                                    | 251          | 110      | 43.82% |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4A                                    | 194          | 90       | 46.39% |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3A                                    | 213          | 72       | 33.80% |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2A                                    | 191          | 78       | 40.84% |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1A                                    | 78           | 15       | 19.23% |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| TOTAL                                 | 1174         | 486      | 41.40% |  |  |  |  |  |  |

| TOTAL COACHES VOTING<br>BY REGION |              |          |        |  |  |  |  |  |
|-----------------------------------|--------------|----------|--------|--|--|--|--|--|
| Region                            | # Of Schools | # Voting | Pct    |  |  |  |  |  |
| Region 1                          | 283          | 110      | 38.87% |  |  |  |  |  |
| Region 2                          | 293          | 131      | 44.71% |  |  |  |  |  |
| Region 3                          | 300          | 129      | 43.00% |  |  |  |  |  |
| Region 4                          | 298          | 116      | 38.93% |  |  |  |  |  |
| TOTAL                             | 1174         | 486      | 41.40% |  |  |  |  |  |

# TOTAL COACHES VOTING BY CONFERENCE & REGION

|             |              |          | <b>.</b> . |
|-------------|--------------|----------|------------|
| Region      | # Of Schools | # Voting | Pct        |
| 6A REGION 1 | 62           | 25       | 40.32%     |
| 6A REGION 2 | 64           | 34       | 53.13%     |
| 6A REGION 3 | 62           | 32       | 51.61%     |
| 6A REGION 4 | 59           | 30       | 50.85%     |
|             |              |          |            |
| 5A REGION 1 | 56           | 25       | 44.64%     |
| 5A REGION 2 | 60           | 30       | 50.00%     |
| 5A REGION 3 | 64           | 27       | 42.19%     |
| 5A REGION 4 | 71           | 28       | 39.44%     |
|             |              |          |            |
| 4A REGION 1 | 45           | 16       | 35.56%     |
| 4A REGION 2 | 45           | 25       | 55.56%     |
| 4A REGION 3 | 51           | 28       | 54.90%     |
| 4A REGION 4 | 53           | 21       | 39.62%     |
|             |              |          |            |
| 3A REGION 1 | 52           | 26       | 50.00%     |
| 3A REGION 2 | 56           | 18       | 32.14%     |
| 3A REGION 3 | 51           | 20       | 39.22%     |
| 3A REGION 4 | 53           | 8        | 15.09%     |
|             |              |          |            |
| 2A REGION 1 | 41           | 14       | 34.15%     |
| 2A REGION 2 | 45           | 23       | 51.11%     |
| 2A REGION 3 | 52           | 17       | 32.69%     |
| 2A REGION 4 | 53           | 24       | 45.28%     |
|             |              |          |            |
| 1A REGION 1 | 27           | 4        | 14.81%     |
| 1A REGION 2 | 23           | 1        | 4.35%      |
| 1A REGION 3 | 13           | 5        | 38.46%     |
| 1A REGION 4 | 15           | 5        | 33.33%     |
|             |              |          |            |

# SURVEY QUESTION #1

# Are you in favor of a mandatory 15-run rule after 3 innings in DISTRICT PLAY?

TOTAL VOTE: YES: 423 (87.04%) NO: 48 (9.88%) UNDECIDED: 15 (3.09%)

# SORTED BY CONFERENCE

#### MANDATORY IN DISTRICT PLAY

|       | YES |        | YES NO |        | UNDECIDED |       |
|-------|-----|--------|--------|--------|-----------|-------|
| 6A    | 99  | 81.82% | 17     | 14.05% | 5         | 4.13% |
| 5A    | 94  | 85.45% | 10     | 9.09%  | 6         | 5.45% |
| 4A    | 76  | 84.44% | 11     | 12.22% | 3         | 3.33% |
| 3A    | 63  | 87.50% | 8      | 11.11% | 1         | 1.39% |
| 2A    | 77  | 98.72% | 1      | 1.28%  | 0         | 0.00% |
| 1A    | 14  | 93.33% | 1      | 6.67%  | 0         | 0.00% |
| Total | 423 | 87.04% | 48     | 9.88%  | 15        | 3.09% |

# SORTED BY REGION (ALL CONFERENCES)

# MANDATORY IN DISTRICT PLAY

|                 | YES |        | NO |        | UNDECIDED |       |
|-----------------|-----|--------|----|--------|-----------|-------|
| <b>REGION 1</b> | 88  | 80.00% | 21 | 19.09% | 1         | 0.91% |
| <b>REGION 2</b> | 115 | 87.79% | 10 | 7.63%  | 6         | 4.58% |
| <b>REGION 3</b> | 111 | 86.05% | 13 | 10.08% | 5         | 3.88% |
| <b>REGION 4</b> | 109 | 93.97% | 4  | 3.45%  | 3         | 2.59% |
| Total           | 423 | 87.04% | 48 | 9.88%  | 15        | 3.09% |

# SORTED BY CONFERENCE AND REGION

#### MANDATORY IN DISTRICT PLAY

|             | YES |         | NO |        | UNDECIDED |       |
|-------------|-----|---------|----|--------|-----------|-------|
| 6A REGION 1 | 15  | 60.00%  | 10 | 40.00% | 0         | 0.00% |
| 6A REGION 2 | 29  | 85.29%  | 3  | 8.82%  | 2         | 5.88% |
| 6A REGION 3 | 27  | 84.38%  | 3  | 9.38%  | 2         | 6.25% |
| 6A REGION 4 | 28  | 93.33%  | 1  | 3.33%  | 1         | 3.33% |
| Total       | 99  | 81.82%  | 17 | 14.05% | 5         | 4.13% |
|             |     |         |    |        |           |       |
| 5A REGION 1 | 18  | 72.00%  | 6  | 24.00% | 1         | 4.00% |
| 5A REGION 2 | 26  | 86.67%  | 2  | 6.67%  | 2         | 6.67% |
| 5A REGION 3 | 23  | 85.19%  | 2  | 7.41%  | 2         | 7.41% |
| 5A REGION 4 | 27  | 96.43%  | 0  | 0.00%  | 1         | 3.57% |
| Total       | 94  | 85.45%  | 10 | 9.09%  | 6         | 5.45% |
|             |     |         |    |        |           |       |
| 4A REGION 1 | 14  | 87.50%  | 2  | 12.50% | 0         | 0.00% |
| 4A REGION 2 | 21  | 84.00%  | 3  | 12.00% | 1         | 4.00% |
| 4A REGION 3 | 23  | 82.14%  | 4  | 14.29% | 1         | 3.57% |
| 4A REGION 4 | 18  | 85.71%  | 2  | 9.52%  | 1         | 4.76% |
| Total       | 76  | 84.44%  | 11 | 12.22% | 3         | 3.33% |
|             |     |         |    |        |           |       |
| 3A REGION 1 | 24  | 92.31%  | 2  | 7.69%  | 0         | 0.00% |
| 3A REGION 2 | 15  | 83.33%  | 2  | 11.11% | 1         | 5.56% |
| 3A REGION 3 | 16  | 80.00%  | 4  | 20.00% | 0         | 0.00% |
| 3A REGION 4 | 8   | 100.00% | 0  | 0.00%  | 0         | 0.00% |
| Total       | 63  | 87.50%  | 8  | 11.11% | 1         | 1.39% |
|             |     |         |    |        |           |       |
| 2A REGION 1 | 13  | 92.86%  | 1  | 7.14%  | 0         | 0.00% |
| 2A REGION 2 | 23  | 100.00% | 0  | 0.00%  | 0         | 0.00% |
| 2A REGION 3 | 17  | 100.00% | 0  | 0.00%  | 0         | 0.00% |
| 2A REGION 4 | 24  | 100.00% | 0  | 0.00%  | 0         | 0.00% |
|             | 77  | 98.72%  | 1  | 1.28%  | 0         | 0.00% |
|             |     |         |    |        |           |       |
| 1A REGION 1 | 4   | 100.00% | 0  | 0.00%  | 0         | 0.00% |
| 1A REGION 2 | 1   | 100.00% | 0  | 0.00%  | 0         | 0.00% |
| 1A REGION 3 | 5   | 100.00% | 0  | 0.00%  | 0         | 0.00% |
| 1A REGION 4 | 4   | 80.00%  | 1  | 20.00% | 0         | 0.00% |
|             | 14  | 93.33%  | 1  | 6.67%  | 0         | 0.00% |

# SURVEY QUESTION #2

# Are you in favor of a mandatory 15-run rule after 3 innings in the PLAYOFFS?

YES: 317 (65.23%) NO: 112 (23.05%) UNDECIDED: 57 (11.73%)

# SORTED BY CONFERENCE

| MANDATORY IN PLAYOFFS |     |        |     |        |     |         |  |  |  |  |
|-----------------------|-----|--------|-----|--------|-----|---------|--|--|--|--|
|                       | YES |        | NO  |        | UND | DECIDED |  |  |  |  |
| 6A                    | 71  | 58.68% | 37  | 30.58% | 13  | 10.74%  |  |  |  |  |
| 5A                    | 71  | 64.55% | 25  | 22.73% | 14  | 12.73%  |  |  |  |  |
| 4A                    | 57  | 63.33% | 20  | 22.22% | 13  | 14.44%  |  |  |  |  |
| 3A                    | 50  | 69.44% | 15  | 20.83% | 7   | 9.72%   |  |  |  |  |
| 2A                    | 55  | 70.51% | 13  | 16.67% | 10  | 12.82%  |  |  |  |  |
| 1A                    | 13  | 86.67% | 2   | 13.33% | 0   | 0.00%   |  |  |  |  |
| Total                 | 317 | 65.23% | 112 | 23.05% | 57  | 11.73%  |  |  |  |  |

## SORTED BY REGION

#### MANDATORY IN PLAYOFFS

|                 | YES |        | NO  |        | UNI | DECIDED |
|-----------------|-----|--------|-----|--------|-----|---------|
| <b>REGION 1</b> | 71  | 64.55% | 34  | 30.91% | 6   | 5.45%   |
| <b>REGION 2</b> | 83  | 63.36% | 29  | 22.14% | 18  | 13.74%  |
| <b>REGION 3</b> | 83  | 64.34% | 28  | 21.71% | 18  | 13.95%  |
| <b>REGION 4</b> | 80  | 68.97% | 21  | 18.10% | 15  | 12.93%  |
| Total           | 317 | 65.23% | 112 | 23.05% | 57  | 11.73%  |

# SORTED BY CONFERENCE AND REGION

#### MANDATORY IN PLAYOFFS

| Y           | NDATORT | NO      |    |                          | DECIDED |         |
|-------------|---------|---------|----|--------------------------|---------|---------|
| 6A REGION 1 | 12      | 48.00%  | 12 | 48.00%                   | 1       | 4.00%   |
| 6A REGION 2 | 20      | 58.82%  | 10 | 40.00 <i>%</i><br>29.41% | 4       | 11.76%  |
| 6A REGION 3 | 20      | 68.75%  | 6  | 18.75%                   | 4       | 12.50%  |
| 6A REGION 4 | 17      | 56.67%  | 9  | 30.00%                   | 4       | 13.33%  |
| Total       | 71      | 58.68%  | 37 | 30.58%                   | 13      | 10.74%  |
| lotal       | , ,     | 50.0070 | 57 | 50.5070                  | 15      | 10.7470 |
| 5A REGION 1 | 15      | 60.00%  | 8  | 32.00%                   | 2       | 8.00%   |
| 5A REGION 2 | 24      | 80.00%  | 5  | 16.67%                   | 1       | 3.33%   |
| 5A REGION 3 | 16      | 59.26%  | 7  | 25.93%                   | 4       | 14.81%  |
| 5A REGION 4 | 16      | 57.14%  | 5  | 17.86%                   | 7       | 25.00%  |
| Total       | 71      | 64.55%  | 25 | 22.73%                   | 14      | 12.73%  |
|             |         |         |    |                          |         |         |
| 4A REGION 1 | 10      | 62.50%  | 4  | 25.00%                   | 2       | 12.50%  |
| 4A REGION 2 | 14      | 56.00%  | 7  | 28.00%                   | 4       | 16.00%  |
| 4A REGION 3 | 17      | 60.71%  | 6  | 21.43%                   | 5       | 17.86%  |
| 4A REGION 4 | 16      | 76.19%  | 3  | 14.29%                   | 2       | 9.52%   |
| Total       | 57      | 63.33%  | 20 | 22.22%                   | 13      | 14.44%  |
|             |         |         |    |                          |         |         |
| 3A REGION 1 | 19      | 73.08%  | 6  | 23.08%                   | 1       | 3.85%   |
| 3A REGION 2 | 13      | 72.22%  | 3  | 16.67%                   | 2       | 11.11%  |
| 3A REGION 3 | 11      | 55.00%  | 6  | 30.00%                   | 3       | 15.00%  |
| 3A REGION 4 | 7       | 87.50%  | 0  | 0.00%                    | 1       | 12.50%  |
| Total       | 50      | 69.44%  | 15 | 20.83%                   | 7       | 9.72%   |
|             |         |         |    |                          |         |         |
| 2A REGION 1 | 11      | 78.57%  | 4  | 28.57%                   | 0       | 0.00%   |
| 2A REGION 2 | 11      | 47.83%  | 4  | 17.39%                   | 7       | 30.43%  |
| 2A REGION 3 | 13      | 76.47%  | 2  | 11.76%                   | 2       | 11.76%  |
| 2A REGION 4 | 20      | 83.33%  | 3  | 12.50%                   | 1       | 4.17%   |
|             | 55      | 70.51%  | 13 | 16.67%                   | 10      | 12.82%  |
|             |         |         |    |                          |         |         |
| 1A REGION 1 | 4       | 100.00% | 0  | 0.00%                    | 0       | 0.00%   |
| 1A REGION 2 | 1       | 100.00% | 0  | 0.00%                    | 0       | 0.00%   |
| 1A REGION 3 | 4       | 80.00%  | 1  | 20.00%                   | 0       | 0.00%   |
| 1A REGION 4 | 4       | 80.00%  | 1  | 20.00%                   | 0       | 0.00%   |
|             | 13      | 86.67%  | 2  | 13.33%                   | 0       | 0.00%   |

# **SURVEY QUESTION #3**

Are you in favor of an optional 15-run rule after 3 innings (mutually agreed upon by the coaches involved) in the PLAYOFFS?

YES: 391 (80.45%) NO: 74 (15.23%) UNDECIDED: 21 (4.32%)

#### SORTED BY CONFERENCE

| OPTIONAL IN PLAYOFFS |     |        |    |        |           |       |  |  |  |  |
|----------------------|-----|--------|----|--------|-----------|-------|--|--|--|--|
|                      |     | YES    |    | NO     | UNDECIDED |       |  |  |  |  |
| 6A                   | 92  | 76.03% | 25 | 20.66% | 4         | 3.31% |  |  |  |  |
| 5A                   | 93  | 84.55% | 12 | 10.91% | 5         | 4.55% |  |  |  |  |
| 4A                   | 71  | 78.89% | 14 | 15.56% | 5         | 5.56% |  |  |  |  |
| 3A                   | 58  | 80.56% | 13 | 18.06% | 1         | 1.39% |  |  |  |  |
| 2A                   | 66  | 84.62% | 7  | 8.97%  | 5         | 6.41% |  |  |  |  |
| 1A                   | 11  | 73.33% | 3  | 20.00% | 1         | 6.67% |  |  |  |  |
| Total                | 391 | 80.45% | 74 | 15.23% | 21        | 4.32% |  |  |  |  |

# SORTED BY REGION

| OPTIONAL IN PLAYOFFS |        |        |    |        |     |        |  |  |
|----------------------|--------|--------|----|--------|-----|--------|--|--|
|                      | YES NO |        |    | NO     | UND | ECIDED |  |  |
| <b>REGION 1</b>      | 85     | 77.27% | 22 | 20.00% | 3   | 2.73%  |  |  |
| <b>REGION 2</b>      | 110    | 83.97% | 17 | 12.98% | 4   | 3.05%  |  |  |
| <b>REGION 3</b>      | 106    | 82.17% | 16 | 12.40% | 7   | 5.43%  |  |  |
| <b>REGION 4</b>      | 90     | 77.59% | 19 | 16.38% | 7   | 6.03%  |  |  |
| Total                | 391    | 80.45% | 74 | 15.23% | 21  | 4.32%  |  |  |

# SORTED BY CONFERENCE AND REGION

#### **OPTIONAL IN PLAYOFFS**

|             | YES |          | NO | 0110    | UN | DECIDED |
|-------------|-----|----------|----|---------|----|---------|
| 6A REGION 1 | 16  | 64.00%   | 8  | 32.00%  | 1  | 4.00%   |
| 6A REGION 2 | 28  | 82.35%   | 5  | 14.71%  | 1  | 2.94%   |
| 6A REGION 3 | 22  | 68.75%   | 9  | 28.13%  | 1  | 3.13%   |
| 6A REGION 4 | 26  | 86.67%   | 3  | 10.00%  | 1  | 3.33%   |
| Total       | 92  | 76.03%   | 25 | 20.66%  | 4  | 3.31%   |
|             | 52  | , 0.00,0 | 20 | 20100/0 | •  | 0.01/0  |
| 5A REGION 1 | 20  | 80.00%   | 5  | 20.00%  | 0  | 0.00%   |
| 5A REGION 2 | 28  | 93.33%   | 2  | 6.67%   | 0  | 0.00%   |
| 5A REGION 3 | 23  | 85.19%   | 2  | 7.41%   | 2  | 7.41%   |
| 5A REGION 4 | 22  | 78.57%   | 3  | 10.71%  | 3  | 10.71%  |
| Total       | 93  | 84.55%   | 12 | 10.91%  | 5  | 4.55%   |
|             |     |          |    |         |    |         |
| 4A REGION 1 | 11  | 68.75%   | 3  | 18.75%  | 2  | 12.50%  |
| 4A REGION 2 | 21  | 84.00%   | 2  | 8.00%   | 2  | 8.00%   |
| 4A REGION 3 | 25  | 89.29%   | 2  | 7.14%   | 1  | 3.57%   |
| 4A REGION 4 | 14  | 66.67%   | 7  | 33.33%  | 0  | 0.00%   |
| Total       | 71  | 78.89%   | 14 | 15.56%  | 5  | 5.56%   |
|             |     |          |    |         |    |         |
| 3A REGION 1 | 21  | 80.77%   | 5  | 19.23%  | 0  | 0.00%   |
| 3A REGION 2 | 13  | 72.22%   | 5  | 27.78%  | 0  | 0.00%   |
| 3A REGION 3 | 17  | 85.00%   | 2  | 10.00%  | 1  | 5.00%   |
| 3A REGION 4 | 7   | 87.50%   | 1  | 12.50%  | 0  | 0.00%   |
| Total       | 58  | 80.56%   | 13 | 18.06%  | 1  | 1.39%   |
|             |     |          |    |         |    |         |
| 2A REGION 1 | 13  | 92.86%   | 1  | 7.14%   | 0  | 0.00%   |
| 2A REGION 2 | 19  | 82.61%   | 3  | 13.04%  | 1  | 4.35%   |
| 2A REGION 3 | 15  | 88.24%   | 0  | 0.00%   | 2  | 11.76%  |
| 2A REGION 4 | 19  | 79.17%   | 3  | 12.50%  | 2  | 8.33%   |
|             | 66  | 84.62%   | 7  | 8.97%   | 5  | 6.41%   |
|             |     |          |    |         |    |         |
| 1A REGION 1 | 4   | 100.00%  | 0  | 0.00%   | 0  | 0.00%   |
| 1A REGION 2 | 1   | 100.00%  | 0  | 0.00%   | 0  | 0.00%   |
| 1A REGION 3 | 4   | 80.00%   | 1  | 20.00%  | 0  | 0.00%   |
| 1A REGION 4 | 2   | 40.00%   | 2  | 40.00%  | 1  | 20.00%  |
|             | 11  | 73.33%   | 3  | 20.00%  | 1  | 6.67%   |

# MERCY RULE BY DISTRICT -- UIL CONFERENCE 6A

| IVIERCT RU |                    | LI UIL CONFERE            |                              |                          |                             |                             |
|------------|--------------------|---------------------------|------------------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| DISTRICT   | 10 AFTER<br>5 ONLY | 15 AFTER 3, 10<br>AFTER 5 | 15 AFTER<br>4, 10<br>AFTER 5 | ALL OTHERS               | NAME OF COACH<br>SUBMITTING | SCHOOL                      |
| 1          | YES                | NO                        | OPTIONAL                     |                          | Shawn O'Neal                | El Paso Socorro             |
| 2          | YES                |                           |                              |                          | Shawnda Vines               | Midland High                |
| 3          |                    | YES                       |                              |                          | Jeff Lemons                 | Weatherford HS              |
| 4          | YES                |                           |                              |                          | Tim Stuewe                  | Southlake Carroll           |
| 5          |                    | YES                       |                              |                          | Kathy Schoettle             | Allen HS                    |
| 6          | YES                |                           |                              |                          | Porscha Albert              | Lewisville HS               |
| 7          |                    | YES                       |                              |                          | Courtney Sims               | Richardson                  |
| 8          |                    | YES                       |                              |                          | Thanh Kinder                | Grand Prairie HS            |
| 9          |                    | YES                       |                              |                          | Jennifer Sisson             | Garland HS                  |
| 10         |                    | YES                       |                              |                          | Lee Kuyrkendall             | Royse City HS               |
| 11         |                    |                           |                              |                          |                             |                             |
| 12         |                    |                           | YES                          |                          | Bryan Waller                | Copperas Cove               |
| 13         |                    | YES                       |                              |                          | Tim Borths                  | The Woodlands HS            |
| 14         |                    | YES                       |                              |                          | Julie Wyrick                | Spring HS                   |
| 15         | YES                |                           |                              |                          | Barry Wilson                | Klein Oak HS                |
| 16         |                    | YES                       |                              |                          | Michele Biffle              | Langham Creek               |
| 17         |                    | YES                       |                              |                          | Marissa Stevens             | Cy-Fair HS                  |
| 18         |                    |                           |                              | 15 after 3, 8<br>after 5 | Brien Tuffly                | Bellaire                    |
| 19         |                    | YES                       |                              |                          | Billie Powell               | Katy Taylor                 |
| 20         |                    | Yes                       |                              |                          | Jon Maples                  | Fort Bend Dulles            |
| 21         |                    |                           |                              |                          |                             |                             |
| 22         |                    |                           |                              |                          |                             |                             |
| 23         |                    | Yes                       |                              |                          | Laneigh Clark               | Pearland                    |
| 24         |                    |                           |                              | 10 after 4, 8<br>after 5 | Jennifer Knight             | Clear Springs               |
| 25         |                    | YES                       |                              |                          | Jessica Poole               | Cedar Ridge                 |
| 26         |                    | Үер                       |                              |                          | Wade Womack                 | Dripping Springs            |
| 27         |                    | Yes                       |                              |                          | Amanda Balthun              | Clemens                     |
| 28         |                    | Yes                       |                              |                          | Valerie Barrera             | San Antonio-LEE High School |
| 29         |                    | Yes                       |                              |                          | Brian Sandera               | Sotomayor HS                |
| 30         |                    | Yes                       |                              |                          | Javier Morin                | United HS                   |
| 31         |                    |                           |                              |                          |                             |                             |
| 32         |                    | Yes                       |                              |                          | Elias Martinez              | San Benito CISD             |

# **MERCY RULE BY DISTRICT -- UIL CONFERENCE 5A**

| WERCT RU |                    | CI UIL CONFERE            |                              |   |                             |                              |
|----------|--------------------|---------------------------|------------------------------|---|-----------------------------|------------------------------|
| DISTRICT | 10 AFTER<br>5 ONLY | 15 AFTER 3, 10<br>AFTER 5 | 15 AFTER<br>4, 10<br>AFTER 5 | ALL OTHERS                                      | NAME OF COACH<br>SUBMITTING | SCHOOL                       |
| 1        |                    |                           |                              |   |                             |                              |
| 2        | YES                |                           |                              | 15 after 3 if<br>agreed upon by<br>both coaches | Shelley Prather             | Hanks                        |
| 3        |                    |                           |                              | Τ   |                             |                              |
| 4        | Yes                |                           |                              |   | Sherri Culwell              | Lubbock-Cooper               |
| 5        | yes                |                           |                              |   | Laura Williams              | Saginaw                      |
| 6        |                    | Yes                       |                              |   | Drew Wyrick                 | South Hills                  |
| 7        |                    | Yes                       |                              |   | Meghann Morrow              | Everman                      |
| 8        |                    | Yes                       |                              |   | Shannon Sullivan            | Burleson-Centennial          |
| 9        | Yes                | Yes                       |                              | 12 after 4                                      | J.C. Salazar                | R.L. Turner                  |
| 10       | Yes                | If agreed                 |                              |   | Tim O'Brien                 | Frisco Heritage              |
| 11       |                    | Yes                       |                              | 12 after 4                                      | Katie Allen                 | Woodrow Wilson               |
| 12       |                    |                           |                              |   |                             |                              |
| 13       |                    |                           |                              |   |                             |                              |
| 14       |                    | Yes                       |                              |   | Jonathan Rogers             | Red Oak                      |
| 15       |                    | Yes                       |                              |   | Kayla Whatley               | Hallsville                   |
| 16       |                    | Yes                       |                              |   | Kelsie McEachern            | Kingwood Park                |
| 17       |                    | YES                       |                              |   | Aaron Fuller                | Barbers Hill                 |
| 18       |                    |                           |                              |   |                             |                              |
| 19       |                    | YES                       |                              |   | Mario Puente                | Milby HIgh School            |
| 20       |                    |                           |                              |   |                             |                              |
| 21       | Yes                |                           |                              |   | Katie Roberts               | Brenham HS                   |
| 22       | yes                | Yes                       | Yes                          |   | Morgan Birkel               | Ellison High School          |
| 23       |                    | Yes                       |                              |   | Melissa Hall                | Georgetown                   |
| 24       |                    | YES                       |                              |   | Rachel Whatley              | Austin McCallum              |
| 25       |                    |                           |                              |   |                             |                              |
| 26       |                    | Yes                       |                              |   | John Garcia                 | Seguin                       |
| 27       |                    | Yes                       |                              |   | Kevin Lewis                 | CC Ray                       |
| 28       |                    | Yes                       |                              |   | Buentello                   | Medina Valley                |
| 29       |                    | YES                       |                              |   | Melissa Buck                | Victoria East                |
| 30       |                    | YES                       |                              |   | Jessica Cardenas-Russell    | Palmview                     |
| 31       |                    | Yes                       |                              |   | Aissa Hinojosa              | Nikki Rowe                   |
| 32       |                    | Yes                       |                              |   | Rayner Cardenas             | Brownsville Veterans Memoria |

# MERCY RULE BY DISTRICT -- UIL CONFERENCE 4A

| DISTRICT | 10 AFTER<br>5 ONLY | 15 AFTER 3, 10<br>AFTER 5 | 15 AFTER<br>4, 10<br>AFTER 5 | ALL OTHERS | NAME OF COACH<br>SUBMITTING         | SCHOOL                    |
|----------|--------------------|---------------------------|------------------------------|------------|-------------------------------------|---------------------------|
| 1        | Yes                | 15 after 3<br>optional    |                              |            | Laura Pacheco                       | Young Women's STEAM Acade |
| 2        |                    |                           |                              |            |                                     |                           |
| 3        | Yes                |                           |                              |            | Carol Vaughn                        | Andrews                   |
| 4        | Yes                |                           |                              |            | Tessa Powell                        | Perryton High School      |
| 5        |                    |                           |                              |            |                                     |                           |
| 6        |                    | yes                       |                              |            | Adam Arrington                      | Graham                    |
| 7        |                    | yes                       |                              |            | Toby Kloewer                        | Sanger                    |
| 8        |                    | yes                       |                              |            | Jennifer Ragland                    | Bridgeport                |
| 9        |                    |                           |                              |            |                                     |                           |
| 10       |                    | yes                       |                              |            | Rus Mayes                           | Godley                    |
| 11       |                    |                           |                              |            |                                     |                           |
| 12       |                    | yes                       |                              |            | Christopher Barnhill                | North Dallas              |
| 13       |                    | yes                       |                              |            | Lauren Strickland                   | Community                 |
| 14       |                    | yes                       |                              |            | Colby Sales                         | Mabank                    |
| 15       |                    |                           |                              |            |                                     |                           |
| 16       |                    | yes                       |                              |            | Baleigh Briggs                      | Van                       |
| 17       |                    | Yes                       |                              |            | Cheyenne Kirkpatrick                | Kilgore                   |
| 18       |                    | Yes                       |                              |            | Julie Murry                         | Bullard                   |
| 19       |                    | Yes                       |                              |            | Michelle Weichert                   | Silsbee                   |
| 20       |                    | yes                       |                              |            | Karen Slack                         | Liberty                   |
| 21       |                    | Yes                       |                              |            | Voncia Ducre                        | Brazosport                |
| 22       |                    |                           |                              |            |                                     |                           |
| 23       |                    |                           | Yes                          |            | Jimmy Eby                           | Robinson                  |
| 24       |                    | yes                       |                              |            | Michael Cole                        | Lago Vista                |
| 25       |                    | Yes                       |                              |            | Brittney Whitehead.<br>Rachel Toney | Sealy, La Marque          |
| 26       |                    | Yes                       |                              |            | Rilea Sanders                       | Bay City                  |
| 27       |                    | Yes                       |                              |            | Robert Klick                        | Wimberley                 |
| 28       |                    | yes                       |                              |            | Michelle Uribe                      | Gonzales                  |
| 29       |                    | yes                       |                              |            | E.J. McNamara                       | Uvalde                    |
| 30       |                    | Yes                       |                              |            | Nathaniel Mircovich                 | Ingleside                 |
| 31       |                    |                           |                              |            |                                     |                           |
| 32       |                    |                           |                              |            |                                     |                           |
|          |                    |                           |                              | 1          | 1                                   | 1                         |

# MERCY RULE BY DISTRICT -- UIL CONFERENCE 3A

|          | MERCY RULE BY DISTRICT UIL CONFERENCE 3A |                           |                              |   |                             |                         |  |  |
|----------|--|---------------------------|------------------------------|---|-----------------------------|-------------------------|--|--|
| DISTRICT | 10 AFTER<br>5 ONLY                       | 15 AFTER 3, 10<br>AFTER 5 | 15 AFTER<br>4, 10<br>AFTER 5 | ALL OTHERS  | NAME OF COACH<br>SUBMITTING | SCHOOL                  |  |  |
| 1        | yes                                      |                           |                              |   | Nix                         | Tulia                   |  |  |
| 2        | Yes                                      |                           |                              |   | Walt Mangan                 | Idalou                  |  |  |
| 3        | Yes                                      |                           |                              |   |                             |                         |  |  |
| 4        |  |                           |                              |   |                             |                         |  |  |
| 5        |  | Yes                       |                              |   | Michael Seales              | Blanco                  |  |  |
| 6        | YES                                      |                           |                              |   | Erica Jones                 | Jim Ned                 |  |  |
| 7        |  | Yes                       |                              |   | Eric Simmons                | Iowa Park               |  |  |
| 8        |  | Yes                       |                              |   | Maddie Ray                  | Peaster                 |  |  |
| 9        |  | Yes                       |                              |   | Courtney Chambers           | Palmer                  |  |  |
| 10       |  | Yes                       |                              |   | Brandy Courville            | S&S                     |  |  |
| 11       |  | Yes                       |                              |   | Micky Englutt               | Bonham                  |  |  |
| 12       |  | Yes                       |                              | 15/3, 12/4,<br>10/5   | Scott Delozier              | Rains                   |  |  |
| 13       | Yes                                      | Yes                       |                              |   | Taelor Cheshier             | Mineola                 |  |  |
| 14       |  |                           |                              |   |                             |                         |  |  |
| 15       | Yes                                      | Yes                       |                              |   | Tisha Thompson              | Hughes Springs          |  |  |
| 16       | Yes                                      | Yes                       |                              |   | Billy Holcomb               | Arp                     |  |  |
| 17       |  | Yes                       |                              |   | Waylon Whitney              | Maypearl                |  |  |
| 18       |  |                           |                              |   |                             |                         |  |  |
| 19       |  |                           | Yes                          | 15/4, 10/5  | LaBaron Graham              | Cameron                 |  |  |
| 20       |  | Yes                       |                              | 15/3, 10/5  | Ronald Berryhill            | Westwood                |  |  |
| 21       |  | YES                       |                              | 15/3, 10/5  | Crystal Massey              | Huntington              |  |  |
| 22       |  | yes                       |                              |   | Jerry Gore                  | Kirbyville              |  |  |
| 23       |  | Yes                       |                              |   | Doug Sanchez                | Trinity                 |  |  |
| 24       |  |                           |                              |   |                             |                         |  |  |
| 25       |  | Yes                       |                              |   | Chasity Matula              | Industrial              |  |  |
| 26       |  | Yes                       |                              |   | Sammy Scribner              | Marion                  |  |  |
| 27       |  |                           |                              |   |                             |                         |  |  |
| 28       |  | Yes                       |                              | 15/3 10/5   | Monica Chovanec             | Yoakum                  |  |  |
| 29       |  |                           |                              |   |                             |                         |  |  |
| 30       |  | YES                       |                              |   | Thomas De Los Santos        | Santa Gertrudis Academy |  |  |
| 31       |  | Yes                       |                              | Unless mutally<br>agreed upon to<br>keep playing by<br>both schools | Andrew Sierra               | IDEA Donna              |  |  |
| 32       |  |                           |                              |   |                             |                         |  |  |
|          |  |                           |                              |   |                             |                         |  |  |

|          |                    | ICT UIL CONFERE                               | -                            |               |                                       |                           |
|----------|--------------------|---|------------------------------|---------------|---------------------------------------|---------------------------|
| DISTRICT | 10 AFTER<br>5 ONLY | 15 AFTER 3, 10<br>AFTER 5                     | 15 AFTER<br>4, 10<br>AFTER 5 | ALL OTHERS    | NAME OF COACH<br>SUBMITTING           | SCHOOL                    |
| 1        |                    |   |                              |               |                                       |                           |
| 2        |                    | Yes   |                              |               | Kelsey Williams, Jennifer<br>Bourland | Seymour, Vernon Northside |
| 3        |                    | YES   |                              | 15/3 and 10/5 | Armando Morales                       | Floydada                  |
| 4        |                    | 1   |                              |               |                                       |                           |
| 5        | Yes                |   |                              |               | Shane Fuller                          | Reagan County             |
| 6        |                    | 15/3 (if agreed<br>upon at plate)<br>and 10/5 |                              |               | Halee Marth                           | Christoval                |
| 7        |                    | Yes   |                              |               | Jason Botos                           | Hamlin                    |
| 8        |                    | Yes   |                              | 10 after 5    | Jayton Thompson                       | Eula                      |
| 9        |                    | Yes   |                              |               | Alyson Deatherage                     | Windthorst                |
| 10       |                    | Yes   |                              |               | Ryan Starnes                          | Muenster                  |
| 11       |                    |   |                              |               |                                       |                           |
| 12       |                    | Yes   |                              | 15/3 and 10/5 | Keith Johnson, Eddie<br>Gallegos      | Rio Vista, Jonesboro      |
| 13       |                    | Yes   |                              | 1             | Ashley Smith                          | Bruceville-Eddy           |
| 14       |                    | Yes   |                              |               | Mike Saucke                           | Hubbard                   |
| 15       |                    | Yes   |                              | 1             | Bruce Brignac                         | Mart                      |
| 16       |                    | Yes   |                              | 1             | Stephen Trussell                      | Cooper                    |
| 17       |                    |   | Yes                          |               | Trevor Wallace                        | Como-Pickton              |
| 18       |                    |   | Yes                          |               | Kelly Fay                             | Harleton                  |
| 19       |                    | YES   |                              | 15/3 10/5     | Jennifer Hawkins                      | Hawkins                   |
| 20       |                    | Yes   |                              |               | Jayson Engel                          | Kerens                    |
| 21       |                    | Yes   |                              |               | Rusti Hall                            | Corrigan-Camden           |
| 22       |                    | YES   |                              |               | Ryan Mason                            | Shelbyville               |
| 23       |                    |   |                              |               |                                       |                           |
| 24       |                    | Yes   |                              |               | Donald Mayhugh,<br>McKenzie Vaughan   | Chireno, Brookeland       |
| 25       |                    |   |                              | 1             |                                       |                           |
| 26       |                    |   |                              | 1             |                                       |                           |
| 27       |                    | 1   |                              |               |                                       |                           |
| 28       |                    | yes   |                              | 15/3 10/5     | Kenny King                            | Center Point              |
| 29       |                    | YES   |                              | 15/3 10/5     | Shawn Bruns                           | Flatonia                  |
| 30       |                    | yes   |                              | 15/3, 10/5    | Jose Martinez                         | D'Hanis                   |
| 31       |                    | yes   |                              | 15/3 10/5     | James Hinojosa                        | Three Rivers              |
| 32       | +                  | +   |                              |               | +                                     | 1                         |

# **FINAL THOUGHTS**

From my analysis of the results of this survey, I do not think there is a mandate to make a mandatory 15-run rule in the playoffs. Several coaches have asked me why softball needs to have a double or even triple mercy rule when other sports just have one (i.e., baseball at 10 after 5, 1A football at 45 points as halftime or later). Others question why we need the mandatory fifteen run rule in the playoffs when it is not mandated in district play.

The results show that the coaches would more likely favor an optional 15-run rule in the playoffs, like the decisions of the individual District Executive Committees. I am not sure what numbers the UIL, TGCA, and THSCA would consider as a mandate to implement this as a rule favored by the softball coaches in our state. I honestly would like to see a larger majority of coaches participate in this question in the future, but the fact that we were very close to 500 coaches participating is a step forward.

My honest opinion is that if we proceed to a mandatory 15-run rule in the playoffs, then we must do the same for district and non-district play as well. The fact that over 87% of the coaches who participated in the survey favored a 15-run rule in district play would support that thought.

Thanks for your time in reading and consideration of this survey and it is a starting point in the conversation of whether we should have a mandatory or optional 15-run mercy rule in the softball playoffs.

On the following pages are comments taken from the survey from coaches participating.

# COMMENTS:

# **CONFERENCE 6A**

This rule proposal was written as MUTUAL AGREEMENT by BOTH coaches so that no one could be forced into using the run rule.

We eliminated the 15 after 3 inn rule with the new alignment.

I think there should at least be an option.

I have seen teams score 20 runs on a team that couldn't compete with them in the playoffs, until they could get to the 5th inning to end the game. We need to remember that these are high school kids, with sometimes the 4th seed obviously outmatched playing a 1 seed. There is absolutely no reason to run score ups. Ending the game after 3 innings/15 run rule, seems what is best for all the kids playing and isn't that why we're here... what's best for kids.

I've seen and coached too many games that ended in the 3rd with the 15 run rule. Without this in place, those games likely would have been larger blowouts with much bigger deficits. Many of these games, teams are not trying to run up the score (as they shouldn't). In my opinion this does absolutely nothing for either team. It indicates a huge imbalance in skill and caliber, does not create the competition necessary to grow (winning team), and is completely defeating culture-wise and mentally for the losing team.

One team might have a horrendous inning, but then get things going, and the other team might have a similar inning later in the game.

Too many teams make the playoffs. If you are getting beat by 15 after 3 innings that is a prime example

I am still curious why we would be the only sport to have a different mercy rule. If safety were the real reason, are there studies that show softball players are disproportionally injured vs other sports? I understand the mutually agreed upon by both coaches, maybe this is the common ground, but the afore mentioned rational is still my official standing. I would like to see research how softball players are injured more in the first round vs. other sports. If that is the case, then I will be more inclined to agree with the change. Also, keep in mind that some schools drive several hours for playoff games and district and to only play 3 innings might be a reason not to have the 15 after 3.

# **CONFERENCE 5A**

Our district allows it if agreed upon by both coaches. I would like it to be 20 runs after 3 and 15 after 4 innings. Sometimes, if you're home team and you score exactly 15 runs through 2 innings, it doesn't seem like you even played a game.

Our district states for 15 after 3 if agreed upon, some umpires won't even ask they just say this is what it is going to be.

Prevents teams from completely embarrassing and damaging the integrity of the game

# Decide at the Plate

It would alleviate unnecessary high scores because of the disparity of some programs. I have been on the end of both high scores and after a point it is not beneficial for anyone.

# Change it to 5th inning

I think that if coaches agree to use the 15 after 3 innings in playoffs, then the team MUST play 1 game. I don't think it is right to play 3 inning games and force teams to travel both days for that type of a game.

Our district is 15 after 4 not 3

I would love to discuss any questions in regard to what was presented by THSCA for (mutually agreed) upon 15 run rule. I am in favor of 15 run rule as long as agreed upon by coaches in playoffs and only for the first round of playoffs.

This past year I witness too many come backs, thus if a team is capable then they should have the opportunity to play and close the gap.

Should always consider this.

I fully understand some peoples reasonings for wanting the option of using a 15-Run Rule, but do not believe that there needs to be a universal mandate that ties someones hands. Some teams I have played in the past are constantly pushing for the 15 after 3 run rule and I believe 2 things in this regard, if you can't compete, then don't play and if you aren't good enough get better. Everyone essentially has the same opportunities to work with kids during school and outside of it, if you can't get them to show or raise interest, they need to rethink some things. Kids get better with opportunities and experience, whether its good or bad!

99.9% of games that are 15 or more runs after 3 innings are already over. Nobody is getting anything out of those games, other than possibly injured.

# **CONFERENCE 4A**

I do not know that I would call ours mandatory, I think of it more like declaring economic victory in Axis and Allies. I mean, I guess it is mandatory if one or both schools want to enforce it, which, most of the time, is the case.

We are a small school in a very large district & get hammered...there is no 15 after 3 in our district & some games it's hard to keep playing

Especially in the first round against some of the weaker teams. Last year we literally stepped off base for every out in the game except 1.

This would eliminate the beat down that some teams like to put on inferior teams.

I would think that schools should have to both agree on the 15 after 3 rule.

Not 100% sure if district mandates rule because I'm new to this district but fairly certain

Run rule should be in place for a matter of safety and sportsmanship.

I have always agreed with the 15 run mercy rule. I especially like the idea of the mutually agreed upon prior to the start of the game idea.

Mutally agreed upon seems ideal

For obvious reasons, I don't like it mandated in district. Mainly because it limits the number of innings and touches my team gets. As far as playoff go, I like the rule because it allows me to save pitching.

I've seen comebacks from more than 15 runs down due to a team gaining momentum. I wouldn't want to take that opportunity away. Also if a coach feels that a game is in hand, they could get some kids in a playoff setting for experience and not run up a score by playing the better players.

No nobody needs to be beaten by more than 15 runs in a high school softball game. I am a fan of all run rules as they help keep the integrity of the game on tact.

# **CONFERENCE 3A**

15 after 3 in the Playoffs is needed. Especially for the first round.

I am for the 15 after 3 rule, simply because I have been on teams that were power houses and beating someone 30 - 0 does no one any good when they have to be given outs just to get to the 5th inning. I am also coaching a team that struggles and it does them no good to be given outs to get through to 5 innings so they can finish the game. It really tears us down when we play state level teams in our district. 5 inning games take forever when teams do not want to give outs whether they are trying to allow us to get them ourselves or just refusal to do so. I've been on both sides and it does no good for either side.

We beat one school in our district 36-4 and 47-2 last year bunting after the first inning. And won 33-0 in the Bidistrict game as well. Doesn't make anyone better and honestly it truly is a lost game on the schedule to play them

Been on both sides of run rules. The coaches should mutually agree if 3 innings is an option. Sometimes 3 may be perfectly ok for both teams. But, I've gone 2 hrs and 45 minutes to a playoff game and lost in 45 minutes. 9 up, 9 down. If I have to go that far, can we at least play 5? The winning coach won't care. The chances of them losing is near zero. They can get their back-ups experience in a playoff game. Most coaches will step off the bag if needed, to keep the score from getting too bad. I am sure the Umps would prefer 3 since the pay is the same.

It sucks if you are a 4th seed playing in a playoff ball game and you lose 19-0 because you have to finish the game. It gets ugly fast and the emotions you have to deal with from your seniors are not good ones to end on.

The UIL does not recognize a game as a complete game if it is less than 5 innings. Therefore, a 3 inning game should not count in the standings. Also, with the cost of travel and distances some teams have to go, is it really worth going to play a 3 inning game? I have been in games where I was winning big against a team. There are still things you can work on without running up the score. Also, being in the position of being the losing team, I believe you can learn how to persevere and find a way to get the job done.

On occasion you get paired up with a very weak district and this rule would help keep coaches from having to find ways to get themselves out in order not to score 25 or 30runs in a game.

# **CONFERENCE 2A**

I believe 15 run rule should be mandatory atleast for the first 2 rounds, the past 2 years I have not had a playoff caliber team, but do to a very weak district we made it in, and both years were against far superior teams, one of those years the coach of the other team played it right and got the game over in a classy manner. The other year the coach ran the score up because they could, beating us by 28 while still stealing bases.

Been on both sides of the 15 after 3. This is needed in playoffs

Our District has a 15 run after 4 innings

I believe playoff games should be complete games, I would be in favor of 10 after 5